On-scene Investigation / Vehicle to Vehicle Dynamic Science, Inc. / Case Number: DS99020 1997 Ford Taurus Arizona July 1999 This document is disseminated under the sponsorship of the Department of Transportation in the interest of information exchange. The United States Government assumes no responsibility for the contents or use thereof.

The opinions, findings, and conclusions expressed in this publication are those of the authors and not necessarily those of the National Highway Traffic Safety Administration.

The crash investigation process is an inexact science which requires that physical evidence such as skid marks, vehicular damage measurements, and occupant contact points be coupled with the investigator's expert knowledge and experience of vehicle dynamics and occupant kinematics in order to determine the precrash, crash, and post-crash movements of involved vehicles and occupants.

Because each crash is a unique sequence of events, generalized conclusions cannot be made concerning the crashworthiness performance of the involved vehicle(s) or their safety systems.

Technical Report Documentation Page					
1. Report No.	2. Government Accession No.		3. Recipient Catalog No.		
DS99020					
4. Title and Subtitle			5. Report Date		
In-Depth Accident Invest	tigation		June 1, 2000		
			6. Performing Organization Report No.		
7. Author(s) Dynamic Science	e, Inc.		8. Performing Organization Report No.		
9. Performing Organization name and Address	s		10. Work Unit No. (TRAIS)		
Dynamic Science, Inc.					
530 College Parkway, St	te. K		11. Contract or Grant no.		
Annapolis, MD 21401			DTNH22-94-D-27058		
12. Sponsoring Agency Name and Address			13. Type of report and period Covered		
U.S. Dept. of Transporta	tion (NRD-32)		[Report Month, Year]		
National Highway Traffic	c Safety Administration		14. Sponsoring Agency Code		
400 7th Street, SW					
Wasnington, DC 20590					
15. Supplemental Notes					
^{16.} Abstract This case was initiated in response to a report of an air bag deployment related passenger fatality. This low speed crash took place in the state of Arizona in June, 1999. Vehicle 1, a 1997 Ford Taurus GL four-door (green) driven by a 28-year-old male, was traveling eastbound on a two-lane undivided roadway. The front right bucket seat was occupied by a 3-year-old female (104 cm/41 in., 21.8 kg/48 lbs.) seated in a forward-facing, overhead shield-equipped Cosco Touriva (Model # 02-014) child safety seat ¹ . The seat had been placed in the forward facing toddler position with the shoulder harness threaded through the upper slots-though the harness on the right was twisted. According to post-crash witnesses, the child seat was attached to the vehicle using the lap and shoulder belts. This seating position is equipped with a switchable retractor that is activated by fully unwinding the restraints until the ratchets catch. There are no indications that the retractor had been switched, which would cause the child seat to not be firmly held in place. Vehicle 2, a 1997 Ford Taurus GL four-door (silver) driven by a 77-year-old male, was traveling in front of Vehicle 1. The driver then steered back into the roadway so that as he entered the roadway his path of travel was 90 degrees from his initial path. The driver was wearing dark glasses which he indicated may have contributed to him not seeing Vehicle 1. As Vehicle 2 entered the roadway, the driver of Vehicle 1 began braking-depositing approximately 6 m (20 ft) of locked wheel skids-and steering to the left. The front of Vehicle 1 (12FDEW1) struck the left side of Vehicle 2 (09LPEW2). Vehicle 1 sustained a total delta v of 13.5 km/h (8.4 mph), a longitudinal delta v of -1.2 km/h (-0.7 mph), and a lateral delta v of 13.4 km/h (8.3 mph). The front right occupant sustained a complete separation of the occipital bone and the 1 st cervical vertehra, laceration of the brain stem at the pons and medullary junction, moderate cerebral edema, subarachnoid h					
Air bag, deployment, injury, accident, fatality, passenger.					

19. Security Classif. (of this report)

20. Security Classif. (of this page)

Form DOT F 1700.7 (8_72) Reproduction of this form and completed page is authorized

 1 The case occupant exceeded the seat weight limit of 19.5 kg (43 lbs.) by 2.2 kg (5 lbs.).

21. No of pages

22. Price

Dynamic Science, Inc. Accident Investigation Case Number: DS99020

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Background
Description 1
Investigation Type 1
Crash Location 1
Crash Date
Field Work Completed
ummary
cene Diagram
Detailed Information5
Vehicles
Occupants
Injuries and Injury Mechanisms
Occupant Kinematics 13
Attachment 1. Child Safety Seat Instructions

BACKGROUND:

Description:	This case was initiated in response to a report of an air bag deployment related passenger fatality. The case was conducted as an on-scene investigation. NHTSA was notified by local fire department. DSI was notified on July 1, 1999. Field work was completed on July 7, 1999. DSI was accompanied during the vehicle and scene inspections by the investigating police officer.
Investigation Type:	On-scene
Crash Location: Crash Date: Notification Date: Field Work Completed:	Arizona June 1999 July 1, 1999 July 7, 1999

SUMMARY:

This low speed crash took place in the state of Arizona in June, 1999. Vehicle 1, a 1997 Ford Taurus GL four-door (green) driven by a 28-yearold male, was traveling eastbound on a two-lane undivided roadway. The front right bucket seat was occupied by a 3year-old female (104 cm/41 in., 21.8 kg/48 lbs.) seated in a forward-facing, overhead shield-equipped Cosco Touriva (Model # 02-014, manufacture date 3/25/96) child safety seat². The seat had been placed in the forward facing toddler position with the shoulder



Figure 1. Travel path for Vehicle 1. Arrow shows path Vehicle 2 used to initially exit roadway.

harness threaded through the upper slots-though the harness on the right was twisted. According to post-crash witnesses, the child seat was attached to the vehicle using the lap and shoulder belts. This seating position is equipped with a switchable retractor that is activated by fully unwinding the restraints until the ratchets catch. There are no indications that the retractor had been switched, which would cause the child seat to not be firmly held in place.

²The case occupant exceeded the seat weight limit of 19.5 kg (43 lbs.) by 2.2 kg (5 lbs.).

Vehicle 2, a 1997 Ford Taurus GL four-door (silver) driven by a 77-year-old male, was traveling in front of Vehicle 1. The driver had made a wrong turn and wanted to reverse his path of travel. Vehicle 2 steered onto the right hand shoulder and into a vacant lot. The driver then steered back into the roadway so that as he entered the roadway his path of travel was 90 degrees from his initial path. The driver was wearing dark glasses which he indicated may have contributed to his not seeing Vehicle 1.



Figure 3. Exterior, Vehicle 1

As Vehicle 2 entered the roadway, the driver of Vehicle 1 began braking-depositing

approximately 6 m (20 ft) of locked wheel skids-and steering to the left. The front of Vehicle 1

(12FDEW1) struck the left side of Vehicle 2 (09LPEW2). Vehicle 1 sustained a total delta v of 13.5 km/h (8.4 mph), a longitudinal delta v of -13.4 km/h (-8.4 mph), and a lateral delta v of -1.4 km/h (-0.9 mph). Both air bags in Vehicle 1 deployed at this point.

Vehicle 2 sustained a total delta v of 13.5 km/h (8.4 mph), a longitudinal delta v of -1.2 km/h (-0.7 mph), and a lateral delta v of 13.4 km/h (8.3 mph).

The front right occupant sustained a complete separation of the occipital bone and the 1st cervical vertebra, laceration of the brain stem at the pons and medullary junction, moderate cerebral edema, subarachnoid hemorrhage around the brain stem and on the right and left parietal lobes, an 8.0 x 5.0 cm (3 x 2 in.) subgaleal hemorrhage over the right frontal bone, two subgaleal



Figure 2. Child safety seat, front view

hemorrhages over the left occipital bone measuring $4.0 \ge 4.0 = (1.6 \ge 1.6 = 1.6 = 1.6)$, and a contusion involving the right lung. Externally, this occupant sustained abrasions and contusions to the face, neck, and frenulum/crotch.

It appears that as the driver of Vehicle 1 saw Vehicle 2 he applied the brakes and began steering to the left. As a result of the braking, the child seat slid forward taking up any slack in the lap and shoulder belt.

At impact, both air bags deployed. The tethered passenger side air bag module cover contacted the right arm of the child seat–separating it at the child seat back. The deploying air bag then struck the child fully in the face and wrapped/engaged the neck, causing the facial abrasion and the neck injury.

The child's head was lifted upwards by the deploying air bag causing the separation of the occipital bone and the 1st cervical vertebra. This latter movement loaded the shoulder harnesses causing the abrasions/contusions to the right upper shoulder. The frenulum/crotch injury is likely related to child's upward movement against the crotch strap.

Immediately after the impact, the driver of Vehicle 1 exited the vehicle on the left side and opened the passenger side door. Witnesses indicated that he was struggling to get the child out of the seat. Upon arrival of the police, the child was not breathing and there was no pulse. She was transported to a local medical center where she was pronounced dead at 1558 hours.

The driver of Vehicle 1 was transported to a local hospital where he was treated and released.

The driver of Vehicle 2 has had hip replacement surgery; the crash caused some type of dislocation. He was transported to a local hospital where he was treated and released.

Both vehicles were towed from the scene.

Scene Diagram



DETAILED INFORMATION

Vehicles

1997 Ford Taurus GL four-door sedan (green)		
1FALP52U3VGXXXXXX		
Unknown		
3.0L EFI V6		
None		
None		
Minor rearward crush to front bumper, hood displaced, fractures to passenger side of windshield.		
12FDEW1		
Total	13.5 km/h (8.4 mph)	
Longitudinal	-13.4 km/h (-8.3 mph)	
Latitudinal	-1.2 km/h (-0.7 mph)	
Energy	8,117 joules (5,988 ft-lbs.)	
	1997 Ford Taurus GL four 1FALP52U3VGXXXXXX Unknown 3.0L EFI V6 None None Minor rearward crush to fr fractures to passenger side 12FDEW1 Total Longitudinal Latitudinal Energy	

The interior of Vehicle 1 sustained minor damage from occupant contact. There were no areas of intrusion into the passenger compartment. There was occupant contact evidence to the passenger air bag, the right instrument panel, and the passenger air bag module cover.

This vehicle was equipped with bucket seats in the front left and front right seating positions. The front left seat was adjusted between the middle and rear most track positions. The front right seat was also adjusted between the middle and rear most track position. Both front seats were



Figure 5. Exterior, Vehicle 1

equipped with adjustable head restraints which were not damaged.

The front left air bag was housed in the steering wheel hub and was concealed by asymmetrical H-configuration cover flaps. The circular air bag was equipped with one tether and no vent ports. The bag was not damaged.

The front right air bag was located in the top-instrument panel position. The single air bag module

cover flap was an irregularly shaped rectangular configuration. The 53 x 61 cm (21 x 24 in.) rectangular air bag was equipped with one tether but no vent ports. The air bag had a post-crash excursion of 53 cm (20.8 in.). There was no damage to the air bag, but there were skin transfers found on the left face of the air bag. The module cover engaged the arm of the child safety seat. The module cover was dented and the right arm of the child seat was dislodged.



Figure 6. Passenger side air bag



Figure 7. Passenger side air bag

Veł	nicl	e 2

Description:	1997 Ford Taurus GL four-door sedan (silver)		
VIN:	1FALP52U7VAXXXXXX		
Odometer:	31,581 miles		
Engine:	3.0L EFI V6		
Reported Defects:	None		
Cargo:	None		
Damage Description:	Moderate lateral crush to left front door area and left rear door area. Minor intrusion on left side.		
CDC:	09LPEW2		
Delta V:	Total	13.5 km/h (8.4 mph)	
	Longitudinal	-1.2 km/h (-0.7 mph)	
	Latitudinal	13.4 km/h (8.3 mph)	
	Energy	14,116 joules (10,420 ft-lbs.)	



Figure 8. Exterior, Vehicle 2

Occupants

Vehicle 1	Occupant 1	Occupant 2
Age/Sex:	28/Male	3/Female
Seated Position:	Front left	Front right
Seat Type:	Bucket seat-fabric covered	Bucket seat-fabric covered
Height:	Unknown	104cm/41 in.
Weight:	Unknown	21.8 kg/48 lbs
Occupation:	Unknown	NA
Pre-existing Medical Condition:	None noted	None
Alcohol/Drug Involvement:	None	NA
Driving Experience:	Est. > 10 years	NA
Body Posture:	Normal, upright.	Normal, upright
Hand Position:	Unknown	Unknown
Foot Position:	Right on brake, left on floor	Unknown
Restraint Usage:	None used	Lap and shoulder belt used in conjunction with forward facing child safety seat
Air bag:	Deployed	Deployed

DS99020

Vehicle 2

Age/Sex:	77/Male
Seated Position:	Front left
Seat Type:	Bucket-fabric covered
Height:	Unknown
Weight:	Unknown
Occupation:	Retired
Pre-existing Medical Condition:	Hip replacement surgery
Alcohol/Drug Involvement:	None
Driving Experience:	Unknown
Body Posture:	Unknown
Hand Position:	Unknown
Foot Position:	Right on accelerator, left presumed to be on floor
Restraint Usage:	Lap and shoulder belt used

Injuries and Injury Mechanisms

Vehicle 1

	<u>INJURY</u>	OIC CODE	<u>ICD-9</u>	<u>SOURCE</u>
Driver:	No reported injuries			
FR Occupant:	Atlanto-occipital dislocation with laceration of the brain involving the pons medullary junction	140212.6,8 650208.2,6	851.6	Air bag
	Subarachnoid hemorrhage, right and left parietal lobes	Not codeable-see General NASS injury coding rule #25, item 3.	852.0	Air bag
	Subarachnoid hemorrhage, brain stem	Not codeable-see General NASS injury coding rule #25, item 3.	852.0	Air bag
	Subgaleal hemorrhage, right frontal bone, 8.0 x 5.0 cm	190402.1,7	920.0	Air bag
	Subgaleal hemorrhages (2), left occipital bone, 4.0 x 4.0 cm	190402.1,2	920.0	Air bag
	Contusion, middle lobe, right lung	441402.3,1	861.21	Child seat - tray
	Moderate cerebral edema	140668.3,9	348.5	Air bag
	Laceration over right eye	290600.1,1	910.8	Air bag
	Contusion/abrasion, right eyelid	297402.1,1 297202.1,1	921.0 918.0	Air bag
	Chin abrasion, 11.0 x 3.5	290202.1,8	910.0	Air bag
	Abrasion, anterior/right/left neck, 18.0 x 5.0 cm	390202.1,0	910.0	Air bag
	Abrasions (2), upper chest, 10.0 x 3.0 cm	490202.1,9	911.0 911.0	Child seat tray
	Contusion/abrasion, left side of face	290202.1,2 290402.1,2	910.0 920.0	Air bag
	Abrasion, left ear lobe, 1.0 x 0.4 cm	290202.1,2	910.0	Air bag
	Abrasion, top of right shoulder, 10.0 x 9.0 cm	790202.1,1	912.0	Child seat harness
	Contusion, top of right shoulder, 6.0 x 2.0 cm	790402.1,1	923.00	Child seat harness
	Contusion, frenulum/crotch	545410.1,8	922.4	Child seat harness, crotch belt



Figure 9. External Injuries



Figure 10. Internal Injuries

Vehicle 2

<u>INJURY</u>

OIC CODE

ICD-9 SOURCE

Driver:

No reported injuries

Occupant Kinematics

The front right bucket seat was occupied by a 3-year-old female (104 cm/41 in., 21.8 kg/48 lbs.) seated in a forward-facing, overhead shieldequipped Cosco Touriva (Model # 02-014) child safety seat. The case occupant exceeded the seat weight limit of 19.5 kg (43 lbs.) by 2.2 kg (5 lbs.). The child seat had been placed in the forward facing toddler position with the shoulder harness threaded through the upper slots-though the harness on the right was twisted. The front right fabriccovered bucket seat was adjusted between the middle and rear most track position. According to post-crash



Figure 11. Child safety seat, front view



Figure 12. Child safety seat–chest clip and twisted harness

witnesses, the child seat was attached to the vehicle using the lap and shoulder belts. This seating position is equipped with a switchable retractor

that is activated by fully unwinding the restraints until the ratchets catch. There are no indications that the retractor had been switched, which would cause the of

There are no indications that the retractor had been switched, which would cause the child seat to not be firmly held in place. The chest clip was being used, but appears to have been used in a position which would have been too low on the child.

It appears that as the driver of Vehicle 1 saw Vehicle 2, he applied the brakes and began steering to the left. As a result of the braking, the child seat slid forward taking up any slack in the lap and shoulder belt. One of the child's feet likely contacted the face of the instrument panel (see Figure 15). The child seat is 44 cm (17 in.) long from the back to the front. The post-deployment excursion of the air bag is 53 cm (20.8 in.). The distance from the seat back to the base of the air bag was 78 cm (30.7 in..). Even if the child seat had been properly installed, there still would have been an overlap between the seat and the deploying air bag of approximately 19 cm (7.5 in.).

The front right occupant sustained a complete separation of the occipital bone and the 1st cervical vertebra,



Figure 13. Dislodged shield arm

laceration of the brain stem at the pons and medullary junction, moderate cerebral edema, subarachnoid hemorrhage around the brain stem and on the right and left parietal lobes, an $8.0 \times 5.0 \text{ cm}$ ($3 \times 2 \text{ in.}$) subgaleal hemorrhage over

DS99020

the right frontal bone, two subgaleal hemorrhages over the left occipital bone measuring $4.0 \ge 4.0 \ge (1.6 \ge 1.6 \le 1.6$

At impact, both air bags deployed. The tethered passenger side air bag module cover contacted the right arm of the child seat–separating it at the child seat back and forcing it rearward where it likely struck the child's upper chest causing the upper chest abrasions. The deploying air bag then struck the child fully in the face and wrapped the neck, causing the facial



Figure 14. Front right seat with scaled image of child seat superimposed onto seat image.

abrasions/contusions/laceration and the neck

injury. The child was lifted upwards by the deploying air bag causing the separation of the occipital bone and the 1st

cervical vertebra. This latter movement loaded the shoulder harnesses causing the abrasions/contusions to the right upper shoulder. The frenulum/crotch injury is likely related to child's movement against the crotch strap.



Figure 15. Contact to face of right instrument panel



Figure 16. Passenger side air bag–skin transfers



Figure 17. Fiber transfers, passenger side module cover

DS99020



and LXO/Luxury Overhead Shield 02-054, 02-034, 02-044, 02-025, 02-344, 02-064, COSCO 02-275, 02-244, 02-245

READ AND SAVE THESE INSTRUCTIONS

IMPORTANT!

You must follow the instructions for this child restraint exactly or you will increase your child's tisk of injury or death.

- Refer to your vehicle owner's manual for additional instructions regarding proper use of this child restraint. with your vehicle.
- If you have any questions, call Cosco's Consumer Relations Department, 1-800-544-1108.
- · Before you use this child restrain:, you must read the entire booklet so you understand how to use it correctly. To help you recognize mose instructions which are most critical for your child's safety, we use the following :lodary2

WARNING-URGENT SAFETY INFORMATION

Failure to follow these instructions creates a dangerous simultion that is litely to result in serious injury or death for your child in the event of a crash or sudden stop.

No one can predict if use of a child restraint will prevent injury or death in a particular crash. However, combined with careful driving, proper use of a child restraint can reduce a child's risk of injury or death in most crashes. Your child is worth the time it will take to read and follow these instructions. If after reading these instructions you still have questions, please contact Cosco's Consumer Relations Department, 1-800-544-1108.

General Information

This child restraint is designed for use by children weighing up to 43 pounds (19.5 kg) whose height is 42 inches

GENERAL WARNINGS



- 2. According to Federal government safety standards, for maximum protection, the center rear seating position is the safest position in most vehicles for installing a child restraint. If there is no lap belt in the center rear seat, the use of either of the other rear seating positions is recommended.
- 3. Use the child restraint only or horward facing vehicle seats.
- Do not use on any vehicle seat that pivols of has a back that folds forward unless the seat has a lock. (See vehicle ownor's manual.)
- 5. Check your vehicle seat belts before each use. Use only if the vehicle lap belt can be tightered properly and securely.
- 6. This child restraint should be securely belod in the vehicle even when not in use. In a crish or sudden stop, an interview child restraint could injure other occupants.
- 7. Do not use a child restraint with damagerlor misting parts.



Atta chm ent 1. Chil d safet у seat instr uctio ns

Editor's Notes Touriva Overhead shield: One piece shell with no tubular frame on back or sides of seat; red push bulton adjusts recline stand from reclined to upright position; red button to release shield says "Press"; seat belt for rear-facing position threads under pad of seat beneath child's legs.

(107 cm) or less. This shild restraint has been dynamically crish tested' and conforms to all applicable Federal Motor Vehicle Safety Standards (FMVSS 213) in effect on the date of manufacture.

Recall information

Child restreints could be recalled for safety reasons. You must register this restraint to be reached in a recall. Send your name, address and the restmint's model number and manufacturing date to Cosco Inc., 2525 State Street, Columbus, IN 47201 Attn: Consumer Relations or call 1-800-468-0174, For recall information, call the U.S. Government's Auto Safety Hotline at 1-800-424-9393 (202-366-0123 in the D.C. area.) For Cosco car seal pasts and service, call 1-800-544-1108.

Cut, frayed, or damaged belts must never be used. Do not lubricate buckles and fastences. Do not substitute parts on try to modify the child restraint in any way on your own

- 3. This child restraint must face the rear of the vehicle when used for infants under 20 pounds (9 kg). Do not use rear-lacing in any seal with an air bag: move the child restraint to mother seating location where it can be correctly used tear facing
- 9. Never take your child out of the child restrain; or try to tend to your child's needs while the vehicle is moving.
- 10. Do not use a child restraint that has been it, a crash. I, mus: be replaced.
- Cosco does not recommend the use of any child restrains accessories except Cosco accessories
- 12. Check instructions to other warnings

Parents are a child's first eachers and examples if you always backle your stat belt, your child will think it is the narmal thing to do. Make it a firm minimation; the veb.cle does not go until everyone is buckled up. Make no exceptions.





